****

**00084531: Strengthening Participatory Federalism and Decentralization Project**

**Annual Progress Report**

**January – December 2014**

Photo credits and caption

**Project Snapshot**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Date: | | | January- December 2014 | | | |
| Award ID: | | | 00070684 | | | |
| Project ID: | | | 00084531 | | | |
| Project Title: | | | Strengthening Participatory Federalism and Decentralization | | | |
| Project Start Date: | | | March 2013 | | | |
| Project End Date: | | | December 2017 | | | |
| Implementing Partner: | | | UNDP | | | |
| Responsible Parties: | | | Ministry of Inter-Provincial Coordination, Inter-Provincial Coordination Departments, Chief Minister’s Secretariat, Government of Balochistan, Planning and Development Department, Local Government Departments Balochistan and KPK, Centre for Civic Education, Higher Education Commission of Pakistan, Inter-University Consortium for Promotion of Social Sciences, Chief Minister’s Policy Reform Unit, Council of Pakistan Newspaper Editors, Gilgit Baltistan Policy Institute, Quaid-e-Azam University, Council of Social Sciences, Law Department Balochistan, Energy Department Balochistan, Information Commission Punjab, Centre for Peace and Development Initiatives, DELTA Associates, University of Gujrat, DAWOOD University, Centre for Governance and Public Accountability, Karachi Press Club, Quetta Press Club, Peshawar Press Club, National College of Arts and Search for Common Grounds | | | |
| Project Budget (all years): | | | $ 15,700,835/- | | | |
| Core Resources:  Non-Core Resources:  Government contribution:  Donor 1  Donor 2 | | | $ 15,00,000/- | | | |
| **Project Brief Description and Outputs:** Strengthening Participatory Federalism and Decentralization (SPFD) is a multi-stakeholder project that views the 18th Amendment in terms of governance, development and public policy. It identifies areas where intervention will support transition management at the federal, provincial and local levels. The project strengthens the democratic process and institutions at the federal, provincial and local levels, enabling them to be responsive and accountable to citizens, and effective in equitable service delivery.  SPFD project has four outputs:   * Council of Common Interest (CCI), Provincial Departments of Inter-Provincial Coordination and select line departments are strengthened. * Provinces are technically supported to develop legislative, institutional and policy frameworks on certain devolved subjects, specifically environmental management, human rights health, education, and tax devolution. * Local governments in Balochistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Gilgit-Baltistan are able to incorporate and use methodologies of participatory development planning, implementation and monitoring at the lowest tiers of governance. * Civil society is country wide informed and mobilized to integrate 18th Amendment (federalism and decentralization) in their advocacy, research and development agenda at policy and community levels. | | | | | | |
| Overall Project Quality Rating (mark on the scale of 1 to 5 as per the following criteria): | | | | | | |
| Exemplary (5)  \*\*\*\*\* | High (4)  \*\*\*\* | | | Satisfactory (3)  \*\*\* | Poor (2)  \*\* | Inadequate (1)  \* |
| All outputs are rated High or Exemplary | All outputs are rated Satisfactory or higher, and at least two criteria are rated High or Exemplary | | | One output may be rated Poor, and all other criteria are rated Satisfactory or higher | Two outputs are rated Poor, and all other criteria are rated Satisfactory or higher | One output is rated Inadequate, or more than two criteria are rated Poor |
| Budget 2014 | | $1,024,350 | | | | |
| Expenditure 2014 | | $1,011,213 | | | | |
| Delivery % | | 99% | | | | |

**Contents**

Table of Contents

[1. Introduction 5](#_Toc379272472)

[2. Situation Analysis](#_Toc379272473) 6

[3. Project Performance and results](#_Toc379272474) 7

[3.1 Contribution towards Country Programme Outcome](#_Toc379272475) 7

[3.2 Progress towards Project Results/Outputs](#_Toc379272476) 10

[4. Lessons Learnt](#_Toc379272477) 20

[5. The way forward/ key Priorities for 2014 20](#_Toc379272478)

[Annex: AWP based Reporting Matrix 22](#_Toc379272479)

1. **Introduction**

The 18th Constitutional Amendment has not only revived but also re-oriented radically the democratic and federalist fundamentals of the State of Pakistan. The Amendment is believed to have brought about a set of comprehensive structural changes to guide and redefine the nature of governance in Pakistan. By restoring balance between the Federation and Provinces, the 18th Amendment has emerged as a landmark piece of legislation that could lead to a paradigm shift in Pakistan‘s mode of governance and constitutional architecture.

The 18th Amendment has reviewed 102 Articles. Additionally, 11 recommendations were also enunciated, which falls within the executive authority of the Government. The historic 18th Constitutional Amendment was passed unanimously by the National Assembly on April 8th, 2010 and by the Senate of Pakistan on April 15th, 2010. Subsequently, the Amendment was signed into law by the President of Pakistan on April 19th, 2010.

The Amendment, effected through cross-cutting political support, has unleashed the need for changes in the governance and development realms -- changes that are broad in scope, complex in detail and game-changing in their implications. The Amendment will have a profound impact on the way the country is governed and its economy is managed. The Amendment has massive implications on the overall allocation of subjects between the Federation and the Provinces, entailing a structural shift in the roles and responsibilities at the provincial level.

UNDP Pakistan devoted its energies to analyze emerging challenges and opportunities as a result of the devolution process. To learn more about the impacts of the Amendment UNDP commissioned two assessments – an initial assessment in 2010 and a detailed follow-up assessment in 2011-2012 and 2013. In light of the findings and recommendations of these assessment missions, UNDP Pakistan launched a technical assistance project **Strengthening Participatory Federalism and Decentralization (SPFD)** in Pakistan.

The project aims to inform, facilitate, and support the process of policy formulation and implementation of transition-management at federal, provincial and grassroots levels. By bridging, essentially, the knowledge gap, SPFD intends assisting federal, provincial and local governments for developing, improving and operationalizing the systems, instruments, processes and mechanisms for improved policy formulation and implementation of decentralized service delivery in social sectors.

1. **SITUATION ANALYSIS**

In the aftermath of the 18th Constitutional Amendment, there were attempts by the former Federal Government to recentralize the subjects which have been devolved to provinces by virtue of the abolition of the Concurrent Legislative List (CLL). Seven ministries were re-established by the former Federal Government. The inception of new Government at Federal level in May 2013 resulted in re-organization of the Federal Secretariat as a result four Ministries re-established by the previous government remained intact while three Ministries were merged with other related Divisions and one new Ministry was created. The re-establishment of Ministries on devolved subjects remains a point of contest between federal and provincial governments and this issue is already under debate in Senate and the National Assembly. This lack of will from the federal government to effectively operationalize 18th Amendment hampered the effective implementation of the project.

The provincial governments are obligated under Article 140(A) of the Constitution to devolve authority, powers and resources under its control to local governments. Balochistan government has taken the lead in conducting the local government elections; however, the remaining provinces and regions have not made any headway on this front even in Balochistan local governments have not completely been operationalized. Under these circumstances the project was unable to deliver results stipulated for local governments in 2014.

The political situation in the country with sit-ins from protestors and prolonged political deadlocks in the country made the security situation in the capital precarious. The lingering crisis and fluid situation brought in numerous uncertainties causing delays in progress on project targets.

1. **Project Performance and results** 
   1. **Contribution towards Country Programme Outcome[[1]](#footnote-1)**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CPAP Outcome:  Strengthened Decentralized Governance | | | |
| Indicator(s): Number of gender sensitive legislative reforms and capacity building initiatives that facilitate implementation of the 18th Constitutional Amendment | Baseline: 18th Constitutional Amendment passed in 2010 and provinces to pass necessary legislation and reorganization to complete the process | Target(s): Capacity assessment and reorganization of selected provincial department supported; Research and advocacy for administration and fiscal decentralization to local governments | Achievement(s):  1. Assisted Government of Balochistan to consolidate the provincial budget, the project undertook a pre-budget consultation between political party representatives, civil society, government officials and academia. The consultation generated 15 recommendations out of which 9 were included in the provincial budget of Balochistan.  2. Technical assistance was provided to Gilgit Baltistan (GB) select committee on local governance to pass the GB Local Government Act 2014.  3. To document and streamline the devolution process a Devolution Management Information System (DMIS) was established for the Council of Common Interest Secretariat.  4. Training of Trainers on Balochistan Local Government Act for 25 district level front managers.  4. Institutional structure for the Local Government Department Balochistan was prepared and finalized.  5. Position papers on State of Public Finance in Balochistan, Balochistan Debt to Revenue Ratio and State of School Education in Balochistan were prepared in collaboration with relevant line departments.  6. Union Council wise digital map book showing location of rural settlements, associated road/tracks network, along with population size information was prepared for the planning and development department Balochistan.  7. Supported the Law department of Balochistan a list of legislation post 18th amendment was prepared and out of these 18 laws were passed by the Balochistan Assembly, 11 laws are awaiting approval. All these laws were required to be amended after the passage of 18th Constitutional Amendment. |
| Description of output level high/outcome level results achieved in 2014:  Massive Constitutional Reforms such as the 18th Constitutional Amendment require substantial time, resources, commitment and capacity to translate a federal framework into an effective and sustainable functional reality for the provinces. Therefore, a schematic, sequential and continuous process of transition management, negotiation and resolution is a pre-requisite of effective implementation of the 18th Constitutional Amendment.  After the passage of 18th Constitutional Amendment the first and the foremost phase of transfer of subjects, functions, institutions and initiatives from the federation to the provinces has successfully been completed. This included the transfer of 18 federal ministries and divisions to the provinces. The provincial governments also realize the dividends of 18th amendment and have enacted several laws that are line with the 18th constitutional amendment. Moreover the project has supported different line departments in order to strengthen and build their capacity to implement the 18th Constitutional Amendment.  Some factors that have contributed to the positive change in the outcome include: high level of provincial government’s commitment for implementation of 18th Constitutional Amendment, subordinate legislation/new legislation has been passed by provinces in line with the 18th Constitutional Amendment ,policy and institutional frameworks on devolved subjects are proactively being developed by the provinces, at the federal level, Council of Common Interests Secretariat is being strengthened to document and streamline the devolution process and , civil society is proactively being engaged to ensure the implementation of the 18th Constitutional Amendment. | | | |
| Means of Verification:   * Balochistan Pre-Budget Report * Balochistan Budget * Gilgit Baltistan Local Government Act 2014 * Gilgit Baltistan Local Government Legislation Report * DMIS Needs Assessment * DMIS Final Report * Training Manual & Training Report on Balochistan Local Government Act 2010 * Institutional and Manpower Analysis Local Government Department Balochistan * Position papers for relevant line departments in Balochistan * Digital Map Book * Post 18th Amendment Legislative Agenda | | | |

* 1. **Progress towards Project Results/Outputs[[2]](#footnote-2)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Project Output I:**  Secretariat of the Council of Common Interest (CCI) and Provincial Departments of Inter-Provincial Coordination and select line departments are strengthened | | | | | | | |
| Indicator(s):  1. No of civil servants trained on devolution management  2. No of Inter-Provincial Dialogues organized on prioritized sectors  3. No of Parliamentarians trained through Peer Learning Group  4. Improved Coordination | | Baseline:  1. Lack of a dedicated training module for govt. officials on 18th amendment  2. No Inter-Provincial Dialogues have been organized  3. Parliamentary Peer Learning Groups at a regional level have not been organized  4. DMIS has not been developed | | Target(s):  1. 150 IPC/CCI staff trained  2. Two Inter-Provincial Dialogues organized  3. DMIS developed for Federal IPC | | Achievement(s):  1. Devolution Management Information System (DMIS) developed for CCI Secretariat to document and streamline the devolution process  2. Seminar on Democratic Accountability: Examining the Efficacy of Constitutional Instruments  3. Critical Analysis of Parliamentary Reports | |
| Description of output level results achieved in 2014:  **Strengthening the Secretariat of the Council of Common Interest:**  The Ministry of Inter-Provincial Coordination is currently serving as the Secretariat of the Council of Common Interest (CCI). SPFD project in order to support the CCI Secretariat and to ensure better documentation of the devolution process conducted a needs assessment to develop a Devolution Management Information System (DMIS). Following the assessment an IT based firm was hired to develop the system. The system keeps track of resources, ensures better quality of information, and improves coordination and communication between provinces to ensure decisions are taken in an efficient and timely manner.  **Improved Coordination: Seminar on Democratic Accountability**  SPFD in collaboration with Centre for Civic Education Pakistan (CCEP) jointly organized a research based seminar on “Democratic Accountability: Examining the Efficacy of Constitutional Instruments”. The seminar was held to initiate an informed discussion on constitutional governance focusing on the performance analysis of the CCI, NEC, NFC and POP reports and to critically examine the quality, frequency and efficacy of these instruments of democratic accountability. The recommendations and findings from the seminar were used to critically analyse the parliamentary reports. | | | | | | | |
| Overall Output Status (mark the output on the scale of 1 to 5 as per the following criteria): | | | | | | | |
| Exemplary (5)  \*\*\*\*\* | High (4)  \*\*\*\* | | Satisfactory (3)  \*\*\* | | Poor (2)  \*\* | | Inadequate (1)  \* |
| The project is expected to over-achieve targeted outputs and/or expected levels of quality, and there is evidence that outputs are contributing to targeted outcomes | The project is expected to over-achieve targeted outputs and/or expected levels of quality | | The project is expected to achieve targeted outputs with expected levels of quality | | The project is expected to partially achieve targeted outputs, with less than expected levels of quality | | Project outputs will likely not be achieved and/or are not likely to be effective in supporting the achievement of targeted outcomes |
| Means of Verification   * DMIS Needs Assessment * DMIS Final Report * Seminar Report “Examining the Efficacy of Constitutional Instruments” * Parliamentary Reports Review | | | | | | | |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Project Output II:**  Provincial Governments are technically supported to develop legislative, institutional and policy frameworks on certain devolved subjects, specifically environmental management, human rights health, education, and tax devolution. | | | | | | | |
| Indicator(s):  1. No of Policy Seminars, Briefs & draft laws prepared by CMPRU  2. KPIs developed for tracking of implementation policy decisions  3. Annual Performance Audit Report identifies the status of transition management in provinces | | Baseline:  1. Balochistan government is still grappling with challenges of devolution management  2. Tracking and monitoring of policy decisions remains weak at all tiers of government  3. No progress report published on the current status of the implementation of 18th amendment | | Target(s)  1. 10 seminars, briefs & draft laws prepared by CMPRU  2. SIGOB Mission conducts meeting with provincial & federal governments and prepares an assessment report  3. Annual Performance Audit Report is launched & published | | Achievement(s):  1. Seminar on Valuing Natural Gas Resources: implication for provincial economies.  2. Pre-Budget consultation generated 15 recommendations for the Balochistan budget, 9 of these were incorporated.  3. Position paper on Reforms in Higher Education Balochistan , State of Public Finance in Balochistan, Status of School Education in Balochistan, Balochistan Debt to Revenue Ratio.  4. Prepared Balochsitan Vision & Strategy for Development.  5. Union Council map book to assist P&D Department.  6. Prepared list of legislation required to be passed by provincial assembly post 18th amendment. | |
| Description of output level results achieved in 2014:  **Policy Seminar on Valuing Natural Gas Resources: Implications for Provincial Economies**  To strengthen provincial economies in advocating equity in gas prices Chief Minister’s Policy Reform Unit organized the policy seminar to inform and generate recommendations for the provincial government in order to strengthen their case of joint and equal ownership of natural gas resources. The objective of the dialogue was to sensitize concerned stakeholders about the economic implications of natural resources and its subsequent effect on provincial economies. The dialogue resolved key recommendations which included under-valuing any natural resource of the country will damage its economy, low price of natural gas has wounded the resource producing regions, low gas prices have discouraged conservation which has led to severe shortage of natural gas, agreements regarding exploration should be made with mutual consent of provincial governments, policy should be formulated to ensure share of royalty to the district from where natural resource is extracted and provinces should not be ignored in management of natural resources.  **Recommendations for an inclusive Provincial Budget Balochistan:**  As part of SPFD Project’s initiative to assist Government of Balochistan in effective transition management a Pre-Budget consultation was held in Quetta to deliberate on the critical relevance of resource allocation in Balochistan. The dialogue was undertaken to further improve interaction between the people of the province and their elected representatives and to establish a tradition of eliciting public input and fostering ownership of Balochistan’s fiscal and financial priorities by the elected representatives. The consultation generated 15 recommendations, 9 of which were incorporated in the Provincial Budget.  **Position papers to strengthen Government of Balochistan in consolidating their stance, post 18th Constitutional Amendment:**  The 18th Constitutional Amendment passed in April 2010 has introduced radical reforms by giving unprecedented autonomy to provinces in legislative, fiscal and administrative domains, however, the implementation and institutionalization of decentralization faces significant challenges in a state which has a strong legacy of a dominant centre. After the passage of 18th Amendment it was seen necessary to enhance existing capacities of provincial governments in order to reap dividends for effective transition management. To enhance the capacity of provincial governments SPFD project in collaboration with CMPRU assisted key line departments in preparing position papers on: Reforms in Higher Education, Status of School Education, State of Public Finance, and Balochistan Debt to Revenue Ratio.  **Balochistan Vision & Strategy for Development:**  On request from the CM Balochistan, the Chief Minister’s Policy Reform Unit prepared a concept note which presented a grand design to create a first rate basic infrastructure framework in the province that can enable productive sectors to flourish and contribute to the development of the province and prosperity of the people. It draws up a core program that identifies the engines of growth. The context for the core program has been provided by the Balochistan Comprehensive Development Strategy 2013-2020. The proposed Balochistan Vision and Strategy is a baseline document which can be used by Cabinet Ministers, Assembly Members, Government Officials, Aid Policy Makers, for planning their interventions in the forthcoming years. The document also serves to inform nationally and internationally the priorities of Balochistan Government for development in the upcoming years.  **Strengthening the Planning & Development Department:**  Balochistan is largely a rural society with 70% of the population residing in villages scattered across the province. Knowledge of village location and population, among other information, is essential for planning road network, water infrastructure, and for providing economic and social services to the people. This information is available in scattered form with different organizations, with multiple inconsistencies; Much of the data is not digitized. An effort in collaboration with CMPRU was made to collate the data from various sources and prepare a digital map book showing location of rural settlements and associated road/tracks networks, along with population size information based on topographic and other data sources. Digital maps for 32 districts with essential information were prepared to help line departments, CSOs, private sector in planning their interventions in areas across Balochistan.  **Post 18th Amendment Legislative Agenda:**  The devolution of legislative and fiscal powers as consequence of18th Constitutional Amendment and the 7th NFC Award entailed a wide range of measures by the provinces to give effect to the provisions of the amendment. In particular laws and acts needed to be amended to bring them in line with the constitution. CMPRU and the Law Department of Balochistan carried out a desk research of the legislative agenda post 18th amendment and documented the changes that were required in certain laws and acts after the passage of the amendment. Using the summary the Balochistan assembly has passed 18 laws, 11 laws are awaiting approval, and moreover 48 federal laws also require amendments to bring them in conformity with the 18th amendment. | | | | | | | |
| Overall Output Status (mark the output on the scale of 1 to 5 as per the following criteria): | | | | | | | |
| Exemplary (5)  \*\*\*\*\* | High (4)  \*\*\*\* | | Satisfactory (3)  \*\*\* | | Poor (2)  \*\* | | Inadequate (1)  \* |
| The project is expected to over-achieve targeted outputs and/or expected levels of quality, and there is evidence that outputs are contributing to targeted outcomes | The project is expected to over-achieve targeted outputs and/or expected levels of quality | | The project is expected to achieve targeted outputs with expected levels of quality | | The project is expected to partially achieve targeted outputs, with less than expected levels of quality | | Project outputs will likely not be achieved and/or are not likely to be effective in supporting the achievement of targeted outcomes |
| Means of Verification:   * Seminar Report on Valuing Natural Gas Resources: implication for provincial economies. * Pre-Budget consultation Report * Pre Budget Recommendations Analysis * Position Papers * Balochistan Vision & Strategy for Development * Union Council Map Book * Post 18th Amendment Legislative Agenda Report | | | | | | | |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Project Output III: Local governments are enabled to incorporate and operationalize methodologies of participatory development planning, implementation and monitoring at lowest tiers of governance. | | | | | | | |
| Indicator(s):  1. No of local government functionaries trained on their duties, roles and responsibilities.  2. No of meetings conducted of LGCG to improve coordination between development partners. | | Baseline:  1. All provinces have drafted their LG Laws  2. Local Government elections to be conducted in 2014 | | Target(s):  1. 5000 Local Government Officials are trained  2. Set up Local Governance Coordination Group & organized 4 meetings | | Achievement(s):  1.Drafted the institutional structure of the Local Government Department Balochistan  2. Developed training manual and trained 25 district level front managers on roles and responsibilities under the Balochistan Local Government Act 2010  3. Technical assistance was provided to Gilgit Baltistan (GB) select committee on local governance to pass the GB Local Government Act 2014. | |
| Description of output level results achieved in 2014:  **Strengthening Local Government Department Balochistan:**  In order to support the Government of Balochistan, SPFD project provided technical assistance to the Local Government and Rural Development Department for achieving the tasks of the Cabinet Committee and the Technical Sub-Committee. An expert on Institutional Development was appointed to draft the institutional structure for the Local Government in Balochistan. The institutional and man power analysis report provides a detailed analysis of the local government department Balochistan and proposes the establishment of a human resource information system.  **Training of Local Government Functionaries:**  SPFD project in collaboration with Balochistan Rural Development Academy developed a training manual on Balochistan Local Government Act 2010. The manual was specifically designed to train district level government officials to assist them in effectively carrying out their responsibilities. The manual was pretested in a 4 day training of trainers (ToT) with 25 district level front managers from 6-9 May 2014. The methodology adopted for the ToT was a combination of direct learning and collaborative learning techniques. The concept was to make the elected local councillors understand the Act, the structure along with its vertical and horizontal governance relationships, the financial management and also the changes due to the 18th Amendment.  **Gilgit Baltistan Local Government Act 2014:**  On request from the Gilgit Baltistan (GB) Government, SPFD project provided technical assistance to the GB standing committee on Local Government. The purpose of support was to draft the local government legislation in accordance with the constitutional provisions, provincial perspectives and regional best practices. After several exhaustive meetings and stakeholder consultations the committee was able to finalize the local government law which maximizes benefits of self-governance to the citizens at the lowest tier, introduces local participatory and democratic decision-making processes, encourages women participation in local governments, and ensures effective transfer of power from the regional to the local government. Following the passage of the Local Government Act the GB Government would work with Election Commission of Gilgit-Baltistan to map out the process of conducting the local government elections. | | | | | | | |
| Overall Output Status (mark the output on the scale of 1 to 5 as per the following criteria): | | | | | | | |
| Exemplary (5)  \*\*\*\*\* | High (4)  \*\*\*\* | | Satisfactory (3)  \*\*\* | | Poor (2)  \*\* | | Inadequate (1)  \* |
| The project is expected to over-achieve targeted outputs and/or expected levels of quality, and there is evidence that outputs are contributing to targeted outcomes | The project is expected to over-achieve targeted outputs and/or expected levels of quality | | The project is expected to achieve targeted outputs with expected levels of quality | | The project is expected to partially achieve targeted outputs, with less than expected levels of quality | | Project outputs will likely not be achieved and/or are not likely to be effective in supporting the achievement of targeted outcomes |
| Means of Verification:   * Institutional and Man Power Analysis Local Government Department Balochistan * Training Manual Balochistan Local Government Department * Attendance Sheet of ToT * Participant Feedback * Gilgit Baltistan Local Government Legislation- Case Study * Gilgit Baltistan Local Government Act 2014 | | | | | | | |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Project Output IV:  Civil society is informed and mobilized to integrate 18th Amendment (federalism and decentralization) in their advocacy, research and development agenda at policy and community levels. | | | | | | | |
| Indicator(s):  1. No. of districts covered through constitutional literacy drive  2. No. of federalism fellowships offered  3. No. of policy dialogues conducted on RTI  4. No of media practitioners trained on development & constitutional reporting | | Baseline:  1. Lack of awareness amongst citizens about their constitutional rights and grievance redressal mechanisms  2. Limited policy & academic research on issues of federalism and decentralization  3. RTI laws have not been operationalized at federal and provincial levels  4. Media practitioners lack necessary skills required for constitutional and development reporting | | Target(s):  1. Constitutional literacy campaign is launched in 20 districts across Pakistan  2. 12 fellowships awarded to public university students for research on federalism  3. Four policy dialogues organized on operationalization of RTI  4. establishment of Media Group on Governance | | Achievement(s):  1. Federalism Fellowships to 11 M.Phil. students  2. National Consultations on RTI & analytical legal review of RTI legislation  3. 5 Training modules and training of 200 media practitioners on decentralized development governance reporting  4. Launched The Devolution Diary  5. Established Pakistan Study Group on Federalism  6. Policy Dialogues in KPK and Balochistan on 18th Amendment Provincial Autonomy: Lessons Learnt & Way Forward | |
| Description of output level results achieved in 2014:  **Federalism Fellowships:** The Higher Education Commission in collaboration with the SPFD project launched the indigenous HEC-UNDP Fellowship program which offered 12 fellowships to scholars interested in undertaking research on (i) Federalism & Inter-Governmental Relations in Pakistan, (ii) 18th Constitutional Amendment, (iii) Fiscal Federalism and (iv) Decentralization & Local Government in Pakistani HEC recognized Universities/Degree Awarding Institutes. A total of 36 applicants applied for the fellowship, 11 scholars from Punjab, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Balochistan and Gilgit-Baltistan were selected. The selected scholars, who were already enrolled in MPhil programmes, undertook research on key subjects which included: federation of Pakistan after 18th Amendment; the political economy of decentralization in Southern Punjab; fiscal federalism in Pakistan and 18th Amendment; the 18th Amendment and development outcomes through local government systems - case study of KPK focusing on decentralization and local government; analysis of 7th NFC with reference to Balochistan; Devolution Plan 2001 and its implications for district bureaucracy; politics of provincial.  **National Consultations on RTI & analytical legal review of RTI legislation:**  SPFD Project in partnership with DELTA Associates conducted an analytical and legal review of Right to Information Legislation alongside carrying out provincial and federal consultations to advocate for operationalizing the Right to Information Laws in Pakistan. The notion behind the project was to understand the current legislation on the Right to Information by conducting an analytical review of all provincial acts, to provide forums for informed discussion on the operationalization of the RTI legislation and to seek recommendations to overcome challenges in the improvement of the RTI legislation and its effective implementation. The review and consultations engendered comprehensive recommendations which included the need for Sindh and Balochistan to revisit and update RTI laws, revisiting the role of Federal Ombudsman, need for improvement of record keeping, budgetary allocations for operationalizing RTI laws, ensuring that there is a formal functioning system and efforts should be made to educate the citizens with regards to their fundamental rights and processes.  **Decentralized Development Governance Training:**  Council of Pakistan News Papers Editors (CPNE) and SPFD project agreed to undertake a joint initiative to develop a three day course and conduct trainings for working journalists from print and electronic media. The objective was to develop and deepen the understanding of reporting and editorial staff of newspapers and electronic media on issues related to decentralized development governance in Pakistan. Particularly, the project was expected to improve the frequency and quality of reporting, analysis and editorial appreciation of issues related to the transition management and implementation of the 18th Constitutional Amendment at federal and provincial levels. 5 training modules were developed to train 200 media practitioners.  **The Devolution Diary:**  The Devolution Diary was launched to offer readers access to news and analysis specifically focusing on Federalism, 18th constitutional amendment, social sector governance, inter-provincial coordination, council of common interests, local governance, right to information and ownership of mineral, oil and natural gas resources in Pakistan.  **Pakistan Study Group on Federalism (PSFG):**  The PSGF was established to mobilize and network a community of practise on participatory federalism and decentralization in the country. The PSGF contributes to a body of academic, policy, technical and hands-on knowledge aimed to facilitate and inform the process of transition management of the 18th Constitutional Amendment. The PSGF organized three lectures which included: Reclamation of Federal Democracy through 18th Amendment: Lesson Learnt & Way Forward (Zafarullah Khan), Canadian and German Federations a Lesson for Pakistan (Dieter Wolkewitz & Dr David Jone), and Political Economy of Fiscal Federalism (Dr. Kaiser Bengali).  **Policy Dialogues in KPK and Balochistan on 18th Amendment Provincial Autonomy: Lessons Learnt & Way Forward:**  The policy dialogues were organized to review the challenges of implementation of 18th amendment in the context of Balochistan & KPK. The dialogues provided a forum to discuss and track legislations, policy decisions and steps undertaken by the respective institutions of Balochistan, KPK and Federal Government vis-à-vis 18th Constitutional Amendment. Moreover the dialogues also focused on the gaps, missed opportunities, and failures in claiming provincial rights in the backdrop of 18th Constitutional Amendment. The objectives of the dialogues were to: to engage with political parties, media, academia and civil society to assess the impact of the 18th Constitutional Amendment in the provinces, to identify gaps, missed opportunities and failures in compliance of the 18th Constitutional Amendment with reference to provincial and federal governments; and to enlist provincial demands, claims and responsibilities for the effective implementation of 18th Amendment. | | | | | | | |
| Overall Output Status (mark the output on the scale of 1 to 5 as per the following criteria): | | | | | | | |
| Exemplary (5)  \*\*\*\*\* | High (4)  \*\*\*\* | | Satisfactory (3)  \*\*\* | | Poor (2)  \*\* | | Inadequate (1)  \* |
| The project is expected to over-achieve targeted outputs and/or expected levels of quality, and there is evidence that outputs are contributing to targeted outcomes | The project is expected to over-achieve targeted outputs and/or expected levels of quality | | The project is expected to achieve targeted outputs with expected levels of quality | | The project is expected to partially achieve targeted outputs, with less than expected levels of quality | | Project outputs will likely not be achieved and/or are not likely to be effective in supporting the achievement of targeted outcomes |
| Means of Verification:  Fellowships Final Report  Analytical and Legal Review of RTI Legislation Report  Decentralized Development Governance Training Manual  Participants Feedback  Devolution Diary Newsletters  PSGF Lectures  Policy Dialogues Report | | | | | | | |

1. **Lessons Learnt**

The implementation of the project yielded certain key lessons for the project these include:

* Massive constitutional reforms such as the 18th Constitutional Amendment require substantial time, resources, commitment and capacity to translate a federal framework into an effective and sustainable functional reality for the provinces.
* A schematic, sequential and continuous process of transition management, negotiation and resolution is a pre-requisite of effective implementation of the 18th Constitutional Amendment.
* Project needs to improve coordination and engagement with political and bureaucratic leadership to keep them on board with project activities and to initiate key strategic interventions in all four provinces.
* Informal stakeholder forums with participation of different political parties should be undertaken to deepen understanding and implications of 18th amendment, and highlight challenges in implementation.
* Project needs strengthen provincial information exchanges, coordination and communication in key government counterpart departments to improve progress towards the devolution process.

1. **The way forward/ key Priorities FOR 2015**

The focus for 2015 is going to be building on the key partnerships undertaken during 2014 especially with government counterparts, civil society organizations and academia to support the implementation of project activities across Pakistan. All interventions under the SPFD project will work with and build capacities of existing and new institutional structures. Moreover, the project will employ a consultative process in designing the project activities which will ensure that all interventions reflect the priorities of the relevant stakeholders. The designed activities will be implemented with the support of government counterparts, CSO and Research Centers.

The project will produce knowledge products, create a pool of master trainers, institutionalize course offerings at different institutions, develop institutional & policy frameworks, conduct research-based advocacy, and raise awareness about federalism and decentralization in Pakistan. The key priorities for 2015 would include:

* Strengthening the Inter-Provincial Departments and advocating for the establishment of Council of Common Interest Secretariat.
* To coordinate governance priorities on devolved issues Inter-Provincial Mechanisms will be set up.
* The project will continue to support effective functioning of the Chief Minister’s Policy Reform Unit in Balochistan.
* With the local government elections expected to be conducted in the provinces in 2015, the focus of the project would shift towards supporting the provincial. Governments in training the newly-elected local government functionaries to enable them to perform their duties effectively.
* Project will strengthen provincial information exchanges, coordination and communication in key government counterpart departments to improve progress towards the devolution process.
* Constitutional Literacy, academic research and policy advocacy on issues of federalism and decentralization will continue to be mainstreamed in all project activities.

**Annex: AWP based Reporting Matrix**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **EXPECTED OUTPUTS**  *And baseline, associated indicators and annual targets* | **PLANNED ACTIVITIES (as per AWP)** | **Activity Status**  *Completed, Ongoing, Delayed, Cancelled* | **AWP Budget ($)** | **Expenditure ($)** | **% Delivery** |
| Project Output 1:  **Secretariat of the Council of Common Interest (CCI) and Provincial Departments of Inter-Provincial Coordination and select line departments are strengthened**  Indicators:  1. No. of civil servants trained on devolution management  2. No. of Inter-Provincial Dialogues organized on prioritized sectors  3. No. of Parliamentarians trained through peer learning groups  4. Improved Coordination  Baseline:  1. Lack of a dedicated training module for govt. officials on 18th amendment  2. No Inter-Provincial Dialogues have been organized  3. Parliamentary Peer Learning Groups at a regional level have not been organized  4. DMIS has not been developed  Targets:  1. 150 IPC/CCI staff trained  2. Two Inter-Provincial Dialogues organized  3. 20 Parliamentarians trained and attended Peer Learning Groups  4. DMIS developed for Federal IPC | 1.1: CCI Secretariat & IPC Dept. Staff is trained | Completed |  |  |  |
| 1.2 : Inter- Provincial collaboration & Knowledge sharing on prioritized sectors | Cancelled | - |  |  |
| 1.3: Parliamentary Peer Learning Groups at a regional/global level for cross-country collaboration | Cancelled | - |  |  |
| 1.4: Establishing Devolution Management Information System (DMIS) for assisting the compliance/follow up of CCI decisions | Ongoing |  |  |  |
| 1.5: Parliamentary and Public Debate on key constitutional reports | Completed |  |  |  |
| Project Output 2: **Provinces are technically equipped in developing legislative, institutional and policy frameworks on devolved subjects including health, education, and tax devolution through establishment of Chief Minister’s Policy Reform Unit.**  Indicators:  1. No. of Policy Seminars, Briefs & draft laws prepared by CMPRU  2. KPIs developed for tracking of implementation of policy decisions  3. Annual Performance Audit Report identifies the status of transition management in provinces  Baseline:  1. Balochistan government is still grappling with challenges of devolution management  2. Tracking and monitoring of policy decisions remains weak at all tiers of government  3. No Progress Report published on the current status of the implementation of 18th Amendment  Targets:  1. 10 Seminars, Briefs & Draft laws prepared by CMPRU  2. SIGOB Mission conducts meetings with provincial & federal governments and prepares an assessment report  3. Annual Performance Audit Report is launched & published | 2.1: CM Policy Reform Unit established for assisting transition management in Balochistan | Ongoing |  |  |  |
| 2.2: Key Performance Indicators developed for effective monitoring & measuring of development results | Cancelled | - |  |  |
| 2.3: Annual Performance Audit Report for tracking and monitoring of progress of devolution management | Cancelled | - |  |  |
| Project Output 3**: Local governments are enabled to incorporate and operationalize methodologies of participatory development planning, implementation and monitoring at lowest tiers of the governance**  Indicators:  1 No. of Local govt. functionaries trained on their duties, roles and responsibilities  2 No. of Meetings conducted of LGCG to improve coordination between development partners  Baseline:  1. All provinces have drafted their LG Laws  2. Local Govt. Elections to be conducted in early 2014 (except for Balochistan which is in 2013)  Targets:  1. 5000 Local Govt. Officials are trained  2. Set up the Local Governance Coordination Group & organize 4 meetings | 3.1: Local Govt. Policy support extended to KP, GB, Balochistan governments for developing policy, legal, operational and fiscal frameworks | Completed |  |  |  |
| 3.2: Local Governance Coordination Group established for enhanced collaboration between development partners | Completed |  |  |  |
| Project Output 4 :**- Civil society is informed and mobilized to integrate 18th Amendment (federalism and decentralization) in their advocacy, research and development agenda at policy and community levels**  Indicators:  1) No. of districts covered through constitutional literacy drive  2 No. of Federalism fellowships offered  3. No. of Policy Dialogues conducted on RTI  4 No. of media practitioners trained on development & constitutional reporting  Baseline:  1. Lack of awareness amongst citizens about their constitutional rights and grievance redressal mechanisms  2. Limited policy & academic research on issues of Federalism and decentralization  3. RTI laws have not been operationalized at Federal and Provincial levels  4. Media Practitioners lack the necessary skills required for constitutional and development reporting  Targets:  1. Constitutional literacy campaign is launched in 20 districts across Pakistan  2. 12 fellowships awarded to public university students for research on Federalism  3. Four Policy Dialogues organized on operationalization of RTI  4. Establishment of Media Group on Governance | 4.1: Constitutional Literacy Drive is launched for increased public awareness | Cancelled | - |  |  |
| 4.2: Policy Research & Analysis on Federalism, FL-11 and Decentralization | Ongoing |  |  |  |
| 4.3: Policy advocacy for drafting & implementation of RTI Laws | Ongoing |  |  |  |
| 4.4: Media Group on Governance is established | Ongoing |  |  |  |
| TOTAL |  |  | 664,350 | 547,140 | 82% |

1. Outcomes describe the intended changes in development conditions that result from the interventions of governments and other stakeholders, including international development agencies such as UNDP. They are medium-term development results created through the delivery of outputs and the contributions of various partners and non-partners. Outcomes provide a clear vision of what has changed or will change globally or in a particular region, country or community within a period of time. They normally relate to changes in institutional performance or behavior among individuals or groups. Outcomes cannot normally be achieved by only one agency and are not under the direct control of a project manager. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Outputs are short-term development results produced by project and non-project activities. They must be achieved with the resources provided and within the time-frame specified (usually less than five years). [↑](#footnote-ref-2)